

Reassembling Social Security

This book is an outstanding achievement. Few could have written a book on welfare reform in Latin America with the depth of knowledge, acute understanding, and easy accessibility that Mesa-Lago is able to use to illuminate on this subject. Our understanding of welfare reforms in the region is in large part due to his work. A wonderful bequest for those researching this area.

Armando Barrientos, Brooks World Poverty Institute at the University of Manchester

This is a unique and updated piece of academic work with a policy oriented approach to Latin American social security issues. Because pensions and health care dominate most of Latin American social policy agenda but also have extremely relevant economic and fiscal consequences, this book is a must for everyone interested in a comprehensive view of this heterogeneous region. Therefore, the book is a valuable resource for experts on pensions, health care, social security, and Latin America.

Fabio M. Bertranou, Senior Social Security Specialist, International Labour Organization (ILO), Santiago, Chile

Without a doubt, Dr. Mesa-Lago's study is the most comprehensive, critical and accurate account of the evolution of social security systems—including an impact evaluation of recent reforms—in the 20 Latin American countries. A must read for policy-makers and scholars interested in social security systems.

Núria Homedes, MD, DrPh, Director of Global Health, University of Texas-Houston, School of Public Health, and Antonio Ugalde, PhD, Professor Emeritus, University of Texas-Austin, Department of Sociology

This book is an elegant and well-researched tour-de-force of Latin American pension and health reforms and their impacts. Drawing on five decades of work on social security systems in Latin America, Carmelo Mesa-Lago bridges the gap between pensions and health care through a cross-cutting analysis of vexing policy issues. This book will become an invaluable asset for all those grappling with the complexities of social policies in Latin America.

Gerard M. La Forgia, Lead Health Specialist, World Bank

This comprehensive volume is written by the most knowledgeable expert on Latin American pension and health care issues, a long-standing observer of social policy making on the subcontinent. His razor-sharp analysis and recommendations deserve many readers in Latin America and beyond.

Dr. Katharina Mueller, Professor of Social Policy, Mannheim University of Applied Sciences

Carmelo Mesa-Lago is one of the masters on economics of Social Security in Latin America. In the last three decades, his ideas, books, and accurate papers had influenced many generations of social economists and policy makers in every country of the Region. This book is a new masterpiece that will contribute to update the knowledge about the achievements and challenges of the last generation of reforms on social security in Latin America.

André Medici, Senior Social Development Specialist, Inter American Development Bank

Reassembling Social Security

*A Survey of Pensions and Health Care
Reforms in Latin America*

Carmelo Mesa-Lago

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

OXFORD

UNIVERSITY PRESS

Great Clarendon Street, Oxford OX2 6DP

Oxford University Press is a department of the University of Oxford.
It furthers the University's objective of excellence in research, scholarship,
and education by publishing worldwide in
Oxford New York

Auckland Cape Town Dar es Salaam Hong Kong Karachi
Kuala Lumpur Madrid Melbourne Mexico City Nairobi
New Delhi Shanghai Taipei Toronto

With offices in

Argentina Austria Brazil Chile Czech Republic France Greece
Guatemala Hungary Italy Japan Poland Portugal Singapore
South Korea Switzerland Thailand Turkey Ukraine Vietnam

Oxford is a registered trademark of Oxford University Press
in the UK and in certain other countries

Published in the United States
by Oxford University Press Inc., New York

© Oxford University Press 2007

The moral rights of the author have been asserted
Database right Oxford University Press (maker)

First published 2007

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced,
stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means,
without the prior permission in writing of Oxford University Press,
or as expressly permitted by law, or under terms agreed with the appropriate
reprographics rights organization. Enquiries concerning reproduction
outside the scope of the above should be sent to the Rights Department,
Oxford University Press, at the address above

You must not circulate this book in any other binding or cover
and you must impose the same condition on any acquirer

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data
Data available

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data
Data available

Typeset by SPI Publisher Services, Pondicherry, India
Printed in Great Britain
on acid-free paper by
Biddles Ltd., King's Lynn, Norfolk

ISBN 978-0-19-923377-9

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

In view of its current relevance, I reproduce herein the dedication in my first social security book published thirty years ago:

This book is devoted to the millions of workers and peasants in Latin America who suffer from lack of coverage or poor protection against social risks. It is intended as a modest contribution to the long quest for a universal, unified, standardized, and equitable social security system in the region.

Social Security in Latin America: Pressure Groups, Stratification, and Inequality
(University of Pittsburgh Press: 1978)

PREFACE: REASSEMBLING SOCIAL SECURITY IN LATIN AMERICA

Since the first social security programs were introduced in Germany in the 1880s, steady progress has been made to improve one of the most important instruments of social protection and welfare designed by human beings. More than half a century has elapsed since the International Labour Organization (ILO) approved the 'minimum norm' that established the following crucial social security principles: (a) universal coverage; (b) equal treatment; (c) solidarity; (d) comprehensiveness, sufficiency, and quality of benefits; (e) unity, state responsibility, efficiency, and social participation in the administration; and (f) financial sustainability.

The two most important social security programs, in terms of the number of insured and beneficiaries, as well as revenues/expenditures, are old-age, disability and survivors pensions, and sickness-maternity or health care. Latin America was a continental pioneer when it introduced these programs in the Southern Cone in the 1910s and 1920s. Ultimately, these programs were implemented in all twenty countries in the region, albeit with significant differences in coverage and benefits. The conventional social security principles reigned without challenge until structural reforms commenced in the 1980s and more so in the 1990s. The structural pension reform ('privatization') introduced by Chile in 1981 gradually influenced other countries in the region, as well as in Central and Eastern Europe, and spurred reform debate in Western Europe and the United States. These pension reforms not only challenged the technical social security international organizations but also affected the design of policies by international financial institutions. Health care reforms, which began in the 1970s and the 1980s, had spread to all twenty countries in the region by the 1990s. The health care reforms have been less radical and more diverse than the pension reforms but both have reassembled or re-engineered social security programs transforming several key principles and setting new goals.

Although pension and health care reforms have social objectives, such as extending coverage and improving equity and quality of benefits, of equal or more importance, have been the following economic aims: (a) maintaining the financial-actuarial equilibrium of the systems and

Preface vii

fiscal stability to cope with population aging in the case of pensions and increasing costs of health care; *(b)* establishment of the principle of equivalence or a strict relationship between contributions and benefit levels as an incentive for enrollment and payment of contributions; *(c)* total or partial replacement of state and/or social insurance monopolies or quasi-monopolies in pensions and health care by private insurance, financing and provision, often combined with decentralization, particularly in health care, and the separation of these functions from those of regulation and supervision that are left to the state; *(d)* development of insurance and provider markets as well as competition among administrators and providers; *(e)* granting the insured freedom of choice between competing pension administrators and health care insurance firms and providers, in pursuit of more efficiency and lower administrative costs; and *(f)* advancement of capital markets and increasing national saving promoted by pension reforms. Without a doubt, these reforms were the most important social development in Latin America in the last century.

In 2004, 160 million workers in Latin America were affiliated with social insurance pensions but only 74 million were active contributors (one-third of the labor force), with 66% participating in public programs and 34% in private schemes. On the other hand, by 2001 about 151 million people were covered by social insurance health care (45% of the total population if Brazil's population and public system are excluded) and 59 million by private insurance (11.5% including Brazil) for a total of 195 million insured, leaving 325 million uninsured. Coverage by the public sector is impossible to estimate, but if those with access to Brazil's public system were added, the total covered would reach about 62% of the population.

There were many valuable resources consulted for this book, including: *(a)* the health care reports of the Pan American Health Organization (PAHO), including profiles of the twenty Latin American countries that describe the features and analyze the results of health reforms; *(b)* the country pension and health care reform studies and regional statistics from the Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean (ECLAC); *(c)* technical documents from the ILO and the International Social Security Association (ISSA); *(d)* comparative world studies and statistics from the World Health Organization (WHO); and *(e)* regional and country reports from the World Bank and the Inter-American Development Bank (IADB). Despite this wealth of information, we still lack a comprehensive, integrated, and comparative study of the pension and health care reforms for all of Latin America that describes their features and evaluates their results.

This book fills the void in the literature through a systematic comparison of pension and health care reforms in all twenty Latin American

viii Preface

countries, which categorizes reform models based on their diverse characteristics and evaluates their impact on social security principles based on standardized, recent statistics, and other data. In addition, the new goals and assumptions of the reforms are contrasted with actual results.

This book is divided into four parts: Part I describes the state of social security prior to the reforms, Part II focuses on pension reforms and their effects, Part III deals with health care reforms and their effects, and Part IV provides policy recommendations in both areas. Chapter 1 summarizes the general evolution of the six conventional social security principles related to pension and health care and indicates which principles had been implemented in the region before the start of the reforms; it also describes the transformation of the conventional principles by the reforms and introduces their new goals. This chapter sets the basis for later comparisons of the social security situation before and after the reforms, as well as to test if the modified conventional principles and new goals forged by the reform have been implemented. Chapters 2 and 7 summarize the major features and key objectives of the pension and health care reforms, develop taxonomies of such reforms and identify the external influences and domestic factors involved in the reform process.

The central part of this book undertakes an analytical comparison of the varied pension and health care reforms, evaluates their effects on the six conventional social security principles, and determines whether the new reforms' goals and assumptions have been implemented and materialized. For that purpose, forty-two standardized tables systematically contrast statistics and other data for each of the twenty countries in the region, most of them with data as recent as 2005 or 2006. Four chapters are devoted to each pension reform (3 to 6) and health care reforms (8 to 11), the latter chapters are larger than those on pensions due to the complexity and diversity of health care reforms. Each chapter ends with a summary of findings on the impact of the reforms on the conventional principles and testing if new goals or assumptions have materialized.

Of particular importance are the answers to the following questions: Have the reforms been successful in increasing coverage and access of the general population? Have health care reforms impeded the concentration of private providers on high- and middle-income groups with lower risks, neglecting poor- and low-income groups with higher risks? Do the new health systems offer a universal, basic package of benefits and have they enhanced quality of services? Have the reforms of both programs improved financial equity, solidarity, and gender equality? Have health reforms achieved an effective decentralization that transfers adequate authority, resources, personnel, and services to administrators closer to the participants? Has the state fulfilled its functions of regulating and

Preface ix

supervising, financing costs of the pension transition and providing social assistance to the uninsured population? To what degree has privatization been attained by both types of reform? Is there real competition in the market that effectively gives users freedom of choice and, if so, has it resulted in improved efficiency and reduced administrative costs? Do the participants have available the information and skills needed to select the best administrators and insurance providers? Do the insured participate in the administration of the systems and are their opinions taken into account to improve services? What has been the effect of the reforms on health expenditures, on the distribution of insurance monies among the three health sectors, and on out-of-pocket expenses? Have reforms accomplished a better financial equilibrium and sustainability of the systems and, in the case of pensions, also expanded capital markets and national saving? Have the new incentives controlled evasion and payment delays? Have the reforms improved health status indicators of the population? Are the private systems insulated from political and state interference?

Chapter 12 offers detailed policy recommendations both of a general nature and specific to countries or issues, suggests methods to address the identified problems in the region and thereby improve pension and health care systems in the future. Finally, more than 600 bibliographic sources consulted for this book are listed in the Bibliography.

Despite the author's efforts to verify statistics and information with international, regional, and country experts, as well as to provide the most up-to-date information possible, the enormous scale of this project, and the extensive amount of material covered in this book, impeded a complete review. Therefore, it is probable that errors remain and that information for certain countries is not current. Finally, this book deals with very controversial issues, many of them charged with ideology, polarizing the field with extremes: either totally in favor or totally against the reforms. Although full objectivity is impossible, the issues are addressed in a scholarly fashion and supported with solid data, balancing the positive and negative aspects of the reforms and identifying advantages and disadvantages of public and private systems to correct flaws of both and improve all types of systems and reforms. It is my sincere hope that this book will stimulate debate, improve understanding of these reforms and, above all, contribute to better pensions and health care for the peoples of Latin America and elsewhere.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

It took more than four painstaking years to complete this book. Initially, I wrote separate monographs in Spanish on pension and health care reforms, under the sponsorship of the UN Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean (ECLAC) in Santiago de Chile, which published both: *Las Reformas de Pensiones en América Latina y su Impacto en los Principios de la Seguridad Social* (2004) and *Las Reformas de Salud en América Latina y el Caribe y su Impacto en los Principios de la Seguridad Social* (2006). In 2006 and early 2007, I integrated the two monographs under a common framework, the data was updated, and the resulting text was considerably trimmed, edited, and translated to English. The original version of the pension part discussed public and private pensions in two separate sections that were fused in this book, whereas the original treatment of health care reforms contained separate analyses for each of the twenty countries, which were merged and compacted. These structural changes strengthened and made the comparisons more transparent. The most recent data found in this book is from 2006 even though changes in the health care and pension systems are ongoing and new data are available every day.

Many people and institutions provided valuable help and financial support for this project. Andras Uthoff conceived the original idea and asked me to undertake the project, obtained financing from ECLAC and commented on the two monographs in Spanish; Daniel Titelman endorsed the project also. The Pan American Health Organization provided a grant for the translation, integration, compacting, and updating of the health care part that allowed the author to work full time on the said part; the support of Pedro Brito and Pedro Crocco is gratefully acknowledged. The Center for Latin American Studies of the University of Pittsburgh awarded two research grants in 2003–6 to finance four part-time research assistants to help gather the bibliography and data from the Internet: Gerald Hunter, Lindsey Jones, José Castro, and Javier Vazquez who also did the manuscript reformatting.

Numerous and insightful comments were made by Nicholas Barr, Armando Barrientos, and Katharina Müller (the latter also provided many useful suggestions concerning policies) on the first English draft of the pension part of this book, and by Fabio Bertranou, Cecilia Acuña, Gerard La Forgia, and André Medici on the original Spanish

Acknowledgments xi

version of the health care part, as well as by three anonymous referees for OUP. Lists of questions on the pension part were submitted to and answered by officials and experts on twelve countries: Fabio Bertranou and Alfredo Conte Grand on Argentina; Alberto Bonadona on Bolivia; Helmut Schwarzer, Vinicius Pinheiro, and Rafael Ferreira on Brazil; Alberto Arenas de Mesa and Pamela Gana on Chile; Fabio Durán and Adolfo Rodríguez Herrera on Costa Rica; Omar Everleny Pérez Villanueva on Cuba; Jeffrey Lizardo and Hernando Pérez Montás on the Dominican Republic; Manuel Israel Ruiz on Nicaragua; René Luciani on Panama; Eliana Carranza on Peru; and Alvaro Forteza, Heber Galli, and Ernesto Murro on Uruguay. Similar lists on the health care part were answered by officials and experts in thirteen countries: Rubén Torres and Carlos Vassallo on Argentina; Andre Medici and Sergio Piola on Brazil; Manuel Inostroza Palma on Chile; Juliana Martínez on Costa Rica; Jeffrey Lizardo on the Dominican Republic; Efrem Karolys, María del Carmen Quevedo, and Francisco Penia on Ecuador; Luis José Martínez Villalba on México; Larry Valladares on Nicaragua; René Luciani and Lilian González on Panama; María Elena Ramírez de Rojas on Paraguay; Luis Manrique on Peru; José Enrique Fernández and Patricia Triunfo on Uruguay; and Marino González on Venezuela. In addition, bibliography, documents, data, and/or comments were provided on pensions and/or health care by Lilia M. Archaga de Quirós, Anida Bastidas, Fabio Bertranou, Geraldo Biasoto, Hans-Ulrich Bünger, Sergio Cesaratto, Carmen Corral de Solines, Pedro Crocco, Emilio Cueto, Fabio Durán, Iván Espinoza, Donatella Fabbri, Carlos Filgueira, Rolando Franco, Nélica Gambogi, Michael Gautrey, Rogelio Gómez, Orville Goodin, Roberto Gutiérrez, Núria Homedes, Gerard La Forgia, Marcelo Lalama, María Elena López, Nehemías López, Thomas Manz, Félix Martín, Francisco Mendoza, Eduardo Morón, Rossana Mostajo, Gustavo Nigenda, Lizette Ochoa, Ondina Olivas, Francisco Piena, Ariel Pino, Reiner Radermacher, Roberto Rodríguez Escobar, Ladina Saboz, Ana Sojo, Carmen Solorio, Anja Stuckert, Antonio Ugalde, and Rocío Zegarra. I gratefully acknowledge the valuable support of all these individuals and institutions but take full responsibility for what is said in this book.

Last, but not least, during the four years it took to write this manuscript, my wife Elena gave me her continued support and freed me of many obligations so that I could dedicate more time to writing. She and our three daughters have my solemn promise that this will be my final book, whose long and excruciating process has convinced me that at 73 it is finally time to enjoy retirement.

CONTENTS

List of Tables and Appendices	xx
Abbreviations	xxiii
PART I. INTRODUCTION: THE STATE OF PENSION AND HEALTH CARE IN THE REGION BEFORE THE REFORMS	
I Social Security Principles, Enforcement in Latin America, and Modifications by the Reforms	3
I.1 Introduction	3
I.2 Principles, regional enforcement, and modifications by the reforms	5
I.2.1 Universal coverage	5
I.2.2 Equal treatment	8
I.2.3 Solidarity and income distribution	10
I.2.4 Comprehensiveness and sufficiency of benefits	12
I.2.5 Unity, state responsibility, efficiency, and social participation in administration	14
I.2.6 Financial sustainability	17
I.2.7 Reform assumptions/goals: promotion of national saving and capital markets	21
I.2.8 Reform assumption: immunity to state and political interference	21
I.2.9 Conclusions: enforcement of principles in the region before the reforms	21
PART II. PENSION REFORMS AND THEIR EFFECTS	
2 Pension Reforms: Taxonomy, Goals, and Actors	27
2.1 Private and public systems: taxonomy in Latin America	27
2.2 Types of reforms: structural and parametric	28
2.2.1 Structural reforms	28
2.2.2 Parametric reforms or lack of reforms	31
2.3 Goals and assumptions of pension reforms	32

xiv **Contents**

2.4 External influences, internal actors, and politico-economic environment	32
2.5 One single type of reform/model or several types/models?	34
3 Effects of Pension Reforms on Universal Coverage	36
3.1 Statistical coverage of the labor force by the contributory system	36
3.1.1 Private systems	36
3.1.2 Public systems	39
3.1.3 Comparison of private and public systems coverage	39
3.2 Legal and statistical coverage of groups difficult to affiliate	40
3.2.1 Urban informal sector	41
3.2.2 Rural sector	45
3.2.3 Measures to improve coverage of difficult groups	46
3.3 Social assistance pensions for the uninsured and impact on poverty	47
3.4 Coverage of the older population	51
3.5 Impact of the reforms on coverage	52
3.5.1 Coverage in private and public systems, and regional trends	52
3.5.2 Groups difficult to cover	53
3.5.3 Social assistance and poverty	54
3.5.4 Coverage of the elderly	55
4 Effects on Equal Treatment, Solidarity, and Comprehensiveness/Sufficiency	58
4.1 Equal treatment	58
4.1.1 Survival of privileged schemes and their unequal entitlement conditions	58
4.1.2 Gender inequality	59
4.2 Solidarity and income distribution	63
4.2.1 Solidarity versus equivalence	63
4.2.2 Mechanisms for and against solidarity	64
4.3 Comprehensiveness and sufficiency of benefits	67
4.3.1 Retirement ages and spans, and contribution years in all systems	68
4.3.2 The pension formula in public pensions	70
4.3.3 Adjustment of private and public pensions	72
4.3.4 Levels of noncontributory pensions in private and public systems	73
4.3.5 Are private pensions higher than public pensions?	74

Contents xv

4.4 Impact of the reforms on equal treatment, solidarity, and comprehensiveness/sufficiency	76
4.4.1 Equal treatment	76
4.4.2 Solidarity	77
4.4.3 Comprehensiveness and sufficiency	78
5 Effects on Unity, State Responsibility, Efficiency, Costs, Social Participation, and Reform Goals	83
5.1 Unification versus segmentation	83
5.2 The role of the state	87
5.3 Reform goals: freedom of choice and privatization	89
5.4 Reform goal: competition	93
5.5 Information	95
5.6 Efficiency	97
5.7 Administrative costs	98
5.8 Social participation in the administration	102
5.9 Impact of the reforms on unity, state responsibility, efficiency, costs, social participation, and reform goals	105
5.9.1 Most systems are still segmented or highly segmented	105
5.9.2 The state role continues to be fundamental rather than subsidiary	106
5.9.3 Reform goals: freedom of choice and privatization	106
5.9.4 Reform goal: competition does not work properly or does not exist	107
5.9.5 The insured lack information	107
5.9.6 Uneven gains in efficiency	108
5.9.7 Higher administrative costs in private than in public systems	108
5.9.8 Absence of social participation in private systems	109
6 Effects on Financial Sustainability and Reform Goals	112
6.1 Contributions	112
6.2 Compliance	116
6.3 Components of fiscal costs in private systems in the transition and beyond	120
6.3.1 Operational deficit of the public system	120
6.3.2 Recognition bond	122
6.3.3 Minimum pension	122
6.3.4 Other state guarantees	123
6.4 Estimates and projections of fiscal costs in private systems	123
6.5 Financial and actuarial equilibrium in public systems	126
6.6 Population aging	131

xvi **Contents**

6.7 Reform goals/assumptions: private systems promotion of national saving, capital markets and returns, and immunity against political interference	132
6.7.1 Capital accumulation	133
6.7.2 Increase in national saving	134
6.7.3 Development of the capital markets and portfolio diversification	136
6.7.4 Capital returns	140
6.7.5 Immunity against state and political interference	143
6.8 Impact of the reforms on financial sustainability and reform goals/assumptions	145
6.8.1 Private systems impose higher contributions on workers	145
6.8.2 Compliance deterioration	145
6.8.3 Projection of fiscal costs in private systems	146
6.8.4 Financial and actuarial equilibrium in public systems	146
6.8.5 Population aging	147
6.8.6 Reform goals/assumptions: promotion of national saving, capital markets and capital returns, and immunity against state-political interference	147

PART III. HEALTH CARE REFORMS AND THEIR EFFECTS

7 Health Care Reforms: Taxonomy, Objectives, and Actors	155
7.1 Health care and pension reforms compared	155
7.2 Definition of health care reform	158
7.3 Historical summary of the reforms	159
7.4 Reform goals	159
7.5 Taxonomy of health care systems and their reforms	160
7.6 External influences, internal actors, and political environment	161
7.7 Measuring the effects of health care reforms	163
8 Effects of Health Care Reforms on Universal Coverage	167
8.1 Legal coverage and targets	168
8.1.1 Coverage by the three sectors	168
8.1.2 Fulfillment of reform coverage targets	173
8.2 Estimates of population coverage	173
8.2.1 Problems to estimate coverage	176
8.2.2 Analysis of the available data on coverage: currently and before the reform	177

	Contents	xvii
8.2.3	Rough estimate of regional coverage	179
8.2.4	Trends in coverage by sector	179
8.3	Coverage by location, urban–rural zones, and ethnic groups	180
8.4	Coverage by income level	181
8.5	Coverage of the self-employed and other groups difficult to incorporate	184
8.6	Access and utilization	186
8.7	Causes of poor coverage and nonfulfillment of targets	189
8.8	Impact of the reforms on coverage and fulfillment of targets	193
8.8.1	Legal coverage, groups difficult to incorporate and fulfillment of targets	193
8.8.2	Population coverage and comparisons before and after the reform	195
8.8.3	Geographical, ethnic and income disparities in coverage	196
8.8.4	Access and utilization	197
8.8.5	Causes for low coverage and nonfulfillment of targets	198
9	Effects on Equal Treatment, Solidarity, and Comprehensiveness/Sufficiency	203
9.1	Equal treatment	203
9.1.1	Standardization of benefits and subsisting disparities	204
9.1.2	Financial equity by income levels and geographic areas	206
9.1.3	Inequalities in human and physical resources and in health indicators: geographic areas, health sectors, and ethnic groups	209
9.1.4	Gender inequalities in access and care	211
9.2	Solidarity and income distribution	212
9.2.1	Solidarity vis-à-vis equivalence	213
9.2.2	Mechanisms in favor and against solidarity	214
9.3	Comprehensiveness and sufficiency of benefits	217
9.3.1	Basic package of benefits	217
9.3.2	Catastrophic illnesses and high-complex procedures	224
9.3.3	Perceived quality of benefits	225
9.4	Impact of the reforms on equal treatment, solidarity and comprehensiveness/sufficiency	227
9.4.1	Equal treatment and equity	227
9.4.2	Solidarity	229
9.4.3	Comprehensiveness/sufficiency	230

xviii **Contents**

10	Effects on Unity, State Responsibility, Efficiency, Costs, Social Participation, and Reform New Goals	235
10.1	Unity or integration of the system	236
10.1.1	Integration and coordination in public sector and social insurance	236
10.1.2	Multiplicity in the private sector	240
10.2	Reform goal: separation of functions	241
10.3	Role of the state: regulation and supervision	246
10.4	Reform goal: decentralization	248
10.4.1	Degree of decentralization achieved	249
10.4.2	Decentralization of functions	252
10.4.3	Evaluation of decentralization results	253
10.5	Reform goal: competition	257
10.6	Reform goal: privatization	261
10.7	Reform goal: freedom of choice	264
10.8	Efficiency	266
10.8.1	General indicators of efficiency	267
10.8.2	Major problems of efficiency	270
10.8.3	Measures to improve efficiency	271
10.9	Administrative costs	273
10.10	Social participation in the administration	276
10.10.1	Social participation in the reform process	277
10.10.2	General evaluations of social participation	278
10.10.3	Participatory bodies, representation, functions, and effectiveness	279
10.11	Impact of the reforms on unity, state responsibility, efficiency, costs, social participation, and reform goals	284
10.11.1	Integration and coordination	284
10.11.2	Reform goal: separation of functions	284
10.11.3	State role: regulation and supervision	285
10.11.4	Reform goal: decentralization	285
10.11.5	Reform goals: competition, privatization, and freedom of choice	287
10.11.6	Efficiency and administrative costs	288
10.11.7	Social participation	289
11	Effects on Financial Sustainability and Efficacy	293
11.1	Financial sustainability	293
11.1.1	Health expenditure trends, distribution by sectors and per capita	294
11.1.2	Sources of financing	299
11.1.3	Compliance	308
11.1.4	Reform goal: shift from supply to demand subsidies	313

Contents xix

11.1.5	Financial and actuarial balance	315
11.1.6	Impacts of the reforms on financial sustainability	320
11.2	Efficacy	324
11.2.1	Unfeasibility to measure the impact of the reforms on efficacy	324
11.2.2	Evolution of health indicators in 1990 and 2002	325

PART IV. TOWARDS A BETTER SOCIAL SECURITY IN THE FUTURE

12	Policies on Pensions and Health Care	335
12.1	Pensions	335
12.1.1	Coverage	336
12.1.2	Equal treatment	341
12.1.3	Solidarity and income redistribution	342
12.1.4	Comprehensiveness and sufficiency of benefits	343
12.1.5	Unity, state responsibility, efficiency, costs, social participation, and reform goals	345
12.1.6	Financial sustainability	349
12.1.7	Reform goals: promotion of national saving, capital markets, and capital returns	352
12.1.8	Reform assumption: immunity against state interference	355
12.2	Health care	355
12.2.1	Coverage	357
12.2.2	Equal treatment	362
12.2.3	Solidarity and income redistribution	364
12.2.4	Comprehensiveness and sufficiency of benefits	365
12.2.5	Unity, state responsibility, efficiency, costs, social participation, and reform goals	367
12.2.6	Financial sustainability	376
12.2.7	Impact on health indicators (efficacy)	381
	Appendices	383
	Bibliography	387
	Index	412

LIST OF TABLES AND APPENDICES

2.1 Models and characteristics of private and public pension systems in Latin America, 2006	29
3.1 Percentage of the labor force covered by private systems only, based on affiliates and active contributors, December 2005	37
3.2 Percentage of the labor force covered in private and public contributory pension systems, based on active contributors	38
3.3 Population groups difficult to cover by pensions, between 2001 and 2004, and social assistance pensions in force, 2006	42
3.4 Legal coverage on pensions of groups difficult to incorporate, 2005–6	43
3.5 Percentage of the populations age 65 and above, covered by pensions in private and public systems, between 2000 and 2003	50
4.1 Normal ages of retirement and retirement spans in private and public pension systems, c.2005	61
4.2 Other entitlement conditions for old-age pensions in private and public systems, c.2005	71
5.1 Unification versus segmentation in private and public pension systems, 2005	85
5.2 Degree of privatization: distribution of contributors between private and public pension systems, c.2004	90
5.3 Freedom of choice of the insured in private pension systems, 2005–6	91
5.4 Competition in private pension systems: size of the insured market, number of administrative firms, and concentration, December 2005	93
5.5 Administrative costs in private systems as percentage of wages, December 2005	99
5.6 Administrative costs as percentage of total taxable wages in private and public pension systems, between 2001 and 2005	101
5.7 Social participation in the administration of private and public pension systems, 2005–6	103
6.1 Contributions by employers, workers, and state in private and public pension systems c.2005	113
6.2 Affiliates in private pension systems that contributed in the past month, December 1998 to December 2005, and June 2006 (<i>in percentages</i>)	116
6.3 Fiscal costs of the structural reform in private pension systems, 2006	121
6.4 Domestic estimates and projections of fiscal costs in private systems, at the start of the reform or later, compared with those of the World Bank, 2005 (<i>deficit as % of GDP</i>)	124
6.5 Indicators of financial sustainability in public pension systems, between 2000 and 2004	127

List of Tables and Appendices xxi

6.6 Stock of financial assets accumulated in private pension systems in 2005 and reserves in public pension systems, between 2000 and 2005	133
6.7 Percentage distribution of pension fund in private systems and in two public systems by investment instrument, December 2005	137
6.8 Average annual real gross rates of capital returns in private pension systems and in public systems with invested financial reserves (partly funded: CPC)	140
7.1 Years of start of the reform and subsequent changes, health system types, and main features of the reforms, 2005–6	156
8.1 Legal mandatory coverage of health social insurance by type of occupation, dependents, and pensioners, 2005–6	169
8.2 Health care coverage/access as percentage of the total population before the reform and in 2001–4, and as percentage of the labor force in 1994–8 and 2000–3	174
8.3 Total population covered by health social insurance distributed by income quintiles, between 1996 and 2003	182
9.1 Sufficiency of health care benefits and perceived quality, 2003–5	222
10.1 Degree of unity, coordination or segmentation, number of sectors and separate health care programs, c.2005	237
10.2 Separation of functions in health systems, c.2005	242
10.3 Decentralization of the public health sector, between 1998 and 2005	250
10.4 Indicators of competition and freedom of choice in health care systems, between 2000 and 2005	259
10.5 Indicators of degree of privatization in health-care systems, between 1998 and 2004	263
10.6 Selected indicators of health-care efficiency, between 1997 and 2004	268
10.7 Administrative costs as percentage of expenses in the three health-care sectors, between 1999 and 2005	275
10.8 Social participation in administration of public and social insurance sectors, between 2002 and 2005	280
11.1 Total health expenditure as percentage of GDP (1997–2003) and distributed by three health sectors, and health expenditure per capita in international dollars, 2003	295
11.2 Financing sources of healthcare systems, c.2005	300
11.3 Contributors to social insurance in 1990 and 2002, and evasion and payment delays between 1997 and 2005 (<i>in percentages as specified</i>)	309
11.4 Financial balance of social insurance and private health sectors, between 2000 and 2004	316
11.5 Selected health indicators in Latin America, 1990 and 2002	326
11.6 Ranking of the 20 countries based on health indicators, 1990 and 2002 (<i>ordered from 1 best to 20 worst</i>)	329
Appendix 1 Total population coverage in Argentina: affiliates by health sector, 1989–2004	383
Appendix 2 Total population coverage in Chile: affiliates by health sector, 1984–2003	384
Appendix 3 Total population coverage in Colombia: affiliates by health regime, 1993–2002	384

xxii **List of Tables and Appendices**

Appendix 4 Total population coverage in Mexico: insured and uninsured, by health sector and program, 1985–2002	385
Appendix 5 Comparison of WHO estimates for 2001 on the percentage distribution of health-care expenditures in Latin American in 2001, based on 2004 and 2006 series	385

ABBREVIATIONS

AIOS	Asociación Internacional de Organismos de Supervisión de Fondos de Pensiones (international association of superintendencies of private pensions)
ARS	Administradoras del Régimen Subsidiado (administrators of the subsidized health regime), Colombia, and Administradoras de Riesgos de Salud (health care administrators), Dominican Republic
ASS	Administradoras de Servicios de Salud (health administrators) Guatemala
AUGE/GES	Garantías Explícitas en Salud (basic health care package and other guarantees), Chile
BCU	Banco Central del Uruguay (Uruguay's central bank)
BPS	Banco de Previsión Social (social insurance institute), Uruguay
CCSS	Caja Costarricense de Seguro Social (social insurance institute), Costa Rica
CI	Catastrophic illnesses
CONSAR	Comisión Nacional del Sistema de Ahorro para el Retiro (superintendence of private pension funds), Mexico
CPC	Collective partial capitalization (partly funded) financial pension regime
CSS	Caja de Seguro Social (social insurance institute), Panama
CPI	Consumer Price Index
DILOS	Directorio Local de Salud (local health board), Bolivia
DRG	Diagnosis-Related-Groups payments
EAP	Economically Active Population or labour force
EBAIS	Equipos Básicos de Atención Integral en Salud (local basic health teams), Costa Rica
EMP	Empresas de Medicina Prepaga (prepaid health enterprises), Argentina, and Empresas Médicas Provisionales (health providing enterprises), Nicaragua
EPS	Empresas Promotoras de Salud (health providing enterprises), Colombia, and Entidades Prestadoras de Salud (health providing enterprises), Peru
ESE	Empresas Sociales Estatales (state health providing enterprises), Colombia
ESS	Empresas Solidarias de Salud (health providing enterprises), Colombia
EsSalud	Seguro Social en Salud (social insurance health institute), Peru
FAEC	Fundo de Ações Estratégicas e Compensação (compensation health fund), Brazil
FCS	Fondo de Compensación Solidario (solidarity health fund), Chile

xxiv **Abbreviations**

FF	Fully funded financial regime in pensions
FNR	Fondo Nacional de Recursos (compensation health fund), Uruguay
FNS	Fundo Nacional de Saúde (national health fund), Brazil
FNS	Fondo Nacional Solidario (solidarity health fund), Bolivia
FONASA	Fondo Nacional de Salud (public-social insurance health program), Chile
FOSYGA	Fondo Solidario y de Garantía (solidarity health fund), Colombia
FSC	Fondo Solidario de Compensación (compensation health fund), Chile
FSR	Fondo Solidario de Redistribución (solidarity health fund), Argentina
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
HCP	Highly-complex procedures in healthcare
IADB	Inter-American Development Bank
IAMC	Instituciones de Asistencia Médica Colectiva (collective not-for-profit private health providers), Uruguay
IDSS	Instituto Dominicano de Seguros Sociales (social insurance institute) Dominican Republic
IESS	Instituto Ecuatoriano de Seguridad Social (social insurance institute), Ecuador
IFO	International Financial Organizations
IGSS	Instituto Guatemalteco de Seguridad Social (social insurance institute), Guatemala
IHSS	Instituto Hondureño de Seguridad Social (social insurance institute), Honduras
ILO	International Labor Organization
IMF	International Monetary Fund
IMSS	Instituto Mexicano del Seguro Social (social insurance institute for private workers), Mexico
INP	Instituto de Normalización Previsional (institute of standardization of public pensions), Chile
INS	Instituto Nacional de Seguros (occupational risks institute), Costa Rica
INSS	Instituto Nicaragüense de Seguridad Social (social insurance institute), Nicaragua
IPD	Implicit pension debt
IPS	Instituto de Previsión Social (social insurance institute), Paraguay, and Instituciones Proveedoras de Servicios (health provider institutions), Colombia
ISAPRE	Instituciones de Salud Provisional (private health providers), Chile
ISS	Instituto de Seguro Social (social insurance institute), Colombia
ISSA	International Social Security Association
ISSS	Instituto Salvadoreño del Seguro Social (social insurance institute), El Salvador
ISSSTE	Instituto de Seguridad y Servicios Sociales de los Trabajadores del Estado (social insurance institute for civil servants), Mexico
IVSS	Instituto Venezolano de los Seguros Sociales (social insurance institute), Venezuela

Abbreviations xxv

IMAE	Institutos de Medicina Altamente Especializada (complex medicine providers), Uruguay
MINSALUD	Ministerio de Salud (ministry of health), Costa Rica, Panamá, Peru
MINSAL	Ministerio de Salud (ministry of health), Chile
MINSALUD	Ministerio de Salud (ministry of health), Colombia
MINSAP	Ministerio de Salud Pública (ministry of health), Cuba
MSDS	Ministerio de Salud y Desarrollo Social (ministry of health), Venezuela
MSPAS	Ministerio de Salud Pública y Asistencia Social (ministry of health), Guatemala, and Ministerio de Salud Pública y Asistencia Social (ministry of health), El Salvador
MSPBS	Ministerio de Salud Pública y Bienestar Social (ministry of health), Paraguay
MSPP	Ministerio de Salud Pública y Población (ministry of health), Haiti
NDC	Notional Defined Contribution System
NGO	Non Government Organizations
OISS	Organización Iberoamericana de Seguridad Social
ONA	Office National d'Assurance Vieillesse (old-age social insurance), Haiti
OS	Obras Sociales (social insurance health care providers), Argentina
PAB	Piso de Atención Básica (basic health care package), Brazil, and Plan de Atención Básica (basic health care package), Colombia
PABA	Piso de Atención Básica Ampliado (expanded basic health care package), Brazil
PAC	Planes de Atención Complementaria (supplementary health care plans), Colombia
PAHO	Pan American Health Organization
PAYG	Pay-as-you-go financial pension regime
PBS	Plan Básico de Salud (basic health care package), Dominican Republic
PCSB	Programa de Cuidados Sanitarios Básicos (basic healthcare package) Paraguay
PMO	Programa Médico Obligatorio (basic health care package), Argentina
POS	Plan Obligatorio de Salud (basic healthcare package of contributory regime), Colombia
POSS	Plan Obligatorio de Salud del Régimen Subsidiado (basic health care package of the subsidized regime), Colombia
RGPS	Regime Geral de Previdência Social, Brazil
PSF	Programa de Saúde da Família (family healthcare program), Brazil
PSS	Proveedores de Servicios de Salud (health care providers), Dominican Republic, and Prestadoras de Servicios de Salud (healthcare providers), Guatemala
SAFJP	Superintendencia de Fondos de Jubilaciones y Pensiones (superintendence of private pensions), Argentina
SAFP	Superintendencia de Fondos de Pensiones (superintendence of private pensions), Chile, Peru

xxvi **Abbreviations**

SBC	Superintendencia Bancaria de Colombia (superintendence of banking and pensions).
SBS	Seguro Básico de Salud (basic healthcare package), Bolivia
SENASA	Seguro Nacional de Salud (national healthcare insurance), Dominican Republic
SESPAS	Secretaría de Salud Pública y Asistencia Social (ministry of health), Dominican Republic
SFS	Seguro Familiar de Salud (family health insurance), Dominican Republic
SIAB	Sistema de Informação de Atenção Básica (health information system), Brazil
SIAS	Sistema Integrado de Atención a la Salud (integrated healthcare system), Guatemala
SIBASI	Sistemas Básicos de Salud Integral (local basic health program), El Salvador
SILAIS	Sistemas Locales Integrados de Salud (local basic health program), Nicaragua
SILOSS	Sistemas Locales de Seguridad Social (local basic health program), Honduras
SIS	Seguro Integrado de Salud (integrated health insurance), Peru
SISBEN	Sistema de Información de Salud (health information system), Colombia
SNSS	Sistema Nacional de Servicios de Salud (public national health care service network), Chile
SP	Superintendencia de Pensiones (superintendence of pensions), Costa Rica, El Salvador
SPNS	Sistema Público Nacional de Salud (national health system), Venezuela
SPS	Seguro Popular de Salud (popular health insurance), Mexico
SSA	Secretaría de Salud (ministry of health), Mexico
SSC	Seguro Social Campesino (peasants social insurance), Ecuador
SUMI	Seguro Universal Materno-Infantil (maternal-infant health insurance), Bolivia
SUS	Sistema Único de Saúde (unified health system), Brazil
SPVS	Superintendencia de Pensiones, Valores y Seguros (superintendence of pensions, securities and insurances), Bolivia
SSS	Superintendencia de Seguridad Social (superintendence of public social security), Chile
UCS	Unité Communal du Santé (communal health boards), Haiti
UPC	Unidad por Capitación (capitation unit), Colombia
WHO	World Health Organization